

**THE HUB FOR EDUCATION
FOR REFUGEES IN
EUROPE KNOWLEDGE
BASE:
TECHNICAL REPORT AND
FRAMEWORK**

HERE
**HUB FOR EDUCATION
FOR REFUGEES IN EUROPE**

Authors: Yousef Khalifa Aleghfeli, Joanna McIntyre,
Lucy Hunt, Chris Stone
Contact: HERE@nottingham.ac.uk
Website: www.hubhere.org
Twitter: [@hubHEREeurope](https://twitter.com/hubHEREeurope)
Version 11 (August 2023)

ABSTRACT

The Hub for Education for Refugees in Europe (HERE) provides a central reference point for information relating to refugee education throughout Europe in the form of a curated, searchable database of academic and non-academic resources on refugee education from across the continent, published since 2015. This is supported by the HERE Network which brings together interested parties and key stakeholders in the field of refugee education through online and face-to-face activities aimed at exchanging knowledge and developing research and practice on refugee education across Europe. This technical report begins by explaining the rationale and objectives behind the HERE knowledge base, followed by a description of the methodological steps taken to build the knowledge base. The report then illustrates how researchers in education for refugees in Europe can use the HERE knowledge base.

ABBREVIATIONS

HERE	Hub for Education for Refugees in Europe
EU	European Union
PRISMA	Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic reviews and Meta-Analyses
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation
UNGA	United Nations General Assembly
UNHCR	United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees

Suggested citation

Aleghfeli, Y. K., McIntyre, J., Hunt, L., & Stone, C. (2023). *The Hub for Education for Refugees in Europe Knowledge Base: Technical Report and Framework*. Hub for Education for Refugees in Europe, University of Nottingham.
<http://doi.org/10.17639/nott.7307>

TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION	4
RATIONALE	4
OBJECTIVES	5
METHODS	5
INCLUSION CRITERIA.....	6
INFORMATION SOURCES	6
SEARCH STRATEGY	7
SOURCE OF EVIDENCE SELECTION	8
DATA EXTRACTION	9
DATA ITEMS	9
RELIABILITY CHECKS.....	10
USING THE HERE KNOWLEDGE BASE	10
USING THE SEARCH BAR	10
UNDERSTANDING THE SEARCH RESULTS	11
ANATOMY OF A SINGLE SEARCH RESULT	11
CONCLUSION AND FUTURE DIRECTIONS.....	12
SYNTHESIS OF RESULTS	13
TECHNICAL REPORT REGISTRATION AND FUTURE AMENDMENTS	13
AVAILABILITY OF DATA	13
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	13
FUNDING	14
CONFLICTS OF INTEREST	14
REFERENCES.....	15

INTRODUCTION

With more than 100 million individuals worldwide forcibly displaced as a result of persecution, conflict, violence, human rights violations or events seriously disturbing public order, there are now more refugees or forced migrants in Europe than at any point since the Second World War (UNHCR, 2022). Consequentially, there has been a concentrated effort by the research, policy and practice communities that seeks to understand how education can respond to those newly arrived in Europe, HERE was established to facilitate the sharing and mobilisation of knowledge about the post-migration educational experiences of refugees and forced migrants in Europe. HERE focuses on fostering and encouraging connections among academics, policymakers, practitioners, refugee communities, and various stakeholders in order to facilitate the equitable and inclusive integration of refugees and forced migrants into educational systems across Europe. Ultimately, HERE aims to address gaps in knowledge of the education *about* and *for* refugees and forced migrants who arrived in Europe since 2015, with a focus on their right to inclusive and equitable quality education (UNGA, 1951, 1967; UNESCO, 1960).

Rationale

The issue of refugees' educational access, experiences, and outcomes has gained increasing attention from policymakers, researchers, and the public in recent years (Aleghfeli & Hunt, 2022; McIntyre & Abrams, 2021). Whilst media depictions of the situation in Europe focused on the 'refugee crisis' from the point of view of the countries who have become destinations, the individual human experiences of this crisis from the perspective of refugees are less well documented and shared. As such, HERE was

established as a base for knowledge sharing and mobilisation about refugees' and other forcibly displaced peoples' post-migration experiences in Europe, focusing on their right to an inclusive and equitable quality education in their resettlement context (UNGA, 1951, 1967; UNESCO, 1960). Thus, HERE collates research, advisory and advocacy activity across Europe and brings together academic and stakeholder expertise of policies and practices for integrating people with refugee backgrounds through education.

Objectives

The question that inspired the development of HERE is “*What do we know about the educational provision for and experiences of people from refugee and forcibly displaced backgrounds who have arrived in Europe since 2015?*”. The primary objective of HERE is to be a go-to-place for expertise providing a facilitated flow of information about what is known of the education *about* and *for* refugees and forced migrants through early childhood, formal schooling, non-formal education, informal education, and steps towards lifelong learning through continued adult education and training. The secondary objective of HERE is to develop evidence syntheses that enable the mobilisation of knowledge about refugees' and forced migrants' educational trajectories towards ensuring their right to an inclusive and equitable quality education in Europe (UNGA, 1951, 1967; UNESCO, 1960).

METHODS

The technical report follows the methodology outlined by Aromataris and Munn (2020) and guidelines set by PRISMA (Page et al., 2021a; Page et al., 2021b). A systematic search of relevant databases outlined below is regularly conducted using keywords and subject headings related to refugee education. Studies are only included if

they focus on educational services for refugees in Europe. Data is extracted from the eligible studies for further analysis using a thematic synthesis approach.

Inclusion criteria

The HERE knowledge base includes any quantitative, qualitative or mixed-methods study on refugee education in Europe. Included studies must be:

1. Journal articles, books, book chapters, conference papers, master-level dissertations, doctorate-level dissertations or policy reports;
2. Occurs in educational settings (formal, informal, and non-formal);
3. Written in English or any other language, provided that an adequate translation was provided;
4. Set in at least one European country, as defined by the EU (2023);
5. Refers to the educational trajectories of refugee and forced migrant arrivals to Europe since 2011; and,
6. Published since the year 2015, so as to contextualise the review around more recent patterns of migration into Europe (UNHCR, 2022).

For non-English studies obtained through the systematic search, only studies that include an English abstract are included.

Information sources

The following electronic bibliographic databases and websites are searched to identify journal articles, books, book chapters, conference papers, master-level dissertations, doctorate-level dissertations, and policy reports. Selection of these databases was made after consultation with a steering group of high-level academics and NGOs working in refugee education in Europe:

1. EBSCOhost (Anthropology Plus, British Education Index, Child Development & Adolescent Studies, Cumulative Index to Nursing and Allied Health Literature, EBSCOhost OpenDissertations, Education Abstracts, Education Administration Abstracts, Family & Society Studies Worldwide, Teacher Reference Center);
2. Elsevier SCOPUS;
3. ProQuest (Applied Social Sciences Index & Abstracts, Criminal Justice Database, Education Database, Education Resources Information Center, International Bibliography of the Social Sciences, National Criminal Justice Reference Service, Social Science Database, Sociological Abstracts, Sociology Database, ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global); and,
4. Web of Science (Arts & Humanities Citation Index, Book Citation Index, Conference Proceedings Citation Index, Emerging Sources Citation Index, Science Citation Index Expanded, Social Sciences Citation Index).

Search Strategy

The search strategy includes keywords and subject headings related to educational services and refugees in Europe. After an initial piloting where several search term combinations are trialed, the following search terms and associated Boolean search operator combinations have been identified to search databases for records:

("Refugee*" OR "Asylum-seek*" OR "Asylum seek*" OR "Forced migrant*" OR "Displaced person*" OR "Displaced people*" OR "Unaccompanied" OR "Stateless*" OR "Undocumented*")

AND

("Educat*" OR "Learn*" OR "Teach*" OR "School*" OR "Student*" OR "Pupil*" OR
"Classroom*" OR "Universit*" OR "College*")
AND
("[COUNTRY]")

After piloting, the review finds that the current combination of search terms is optimum for maximising the sensitivity of search. The same search term combination is used across all databases for consistency. Results lists are then filtered to include only those resources which were published since 2015 and are among the study types in the inclusion criteria (when that filtering functionality was available). Moreover, to ensure literature saturation, members of the HERE network and visitors to the HERE website are invited to suggest resources that, providing they meet the inclusion criteria, are included in the knowledge base.

Source of evidence selection

Studies identified through the search strategy are downloaded as RIS files then uploaded to Zotero, a free and open-source reference management software for a first round of deduplication, then onto Rayyan, a free and open-source systematic review management software, for a second round of deduplication. Studies identified through the deduplication process undergo a screening of their title, abstract and author keyword on Rayyan. Upon passing this stage, the final studies are downloaded from Rayyan and collated into one excel worksheet.

Each eligible study in the final excel worksheet is then systematically tagged based on a data codebook that labelled each study with the following code categories:

- Theme: code indicating the thematic focus of the eligible study as it relates to refugee education research.
- Education level: code indicating the level of education at which the eligible study is conducted.
- Method: code indicating methodological and analytical approach pursued by the eligible study.
- Publication format: code indicating the publication format in which the eligible study is published.
- Education type: code indicating which educational subject the eligible study is focusing on.
- County: code indicating the country, or countries, where the eligible study is set.
- Years of publication: code indicating in which year the eligible study was published.
- Publication access: code indicating whether the eligible study is open access or not.

Data extraction

Data extraction is conducted using a standardised form based on the PRISMA guidelines (Page et al., 2021a; Page et al., 2021b). The form includes information on the study design, characteristics of the study population, types of educational services identified (including interventions that address the educational needs of refugees and forced migrants), and summary of key findings. Two internal reviewers identify this specific data in the included studies and copy it onto the standardised forms.

Data items

The data extraction form is used to extract the following data items: 1) Study information (Title, Author(s), Study type, Study URL, Country, Aim, Methods, Access Type); 2) Participant information (Sample data/Source, Age, Nationality, Legal status, Context, Recruitment); 3) Types of educational services; (Education level, Education type); and, 4) Study Summary (Findings, Limitations).

Reliability Checks

Inter-coder reliability checks were conducted as part of the development of the HERE knowledge base to check for reliability. Of the total number of articles, 10% was randomly selected and given to three of our team members who were asked to determine whether a study should be included onto the knowledge base or excluded. From this check, all three coders collectively agreed 90% of the time, which represented high inter-coder agreement according to Miles and Huberman (1994).

USING THE HERE KNOWLEDGE BASE

This section outlines how to use the search functions of the HERE knowledge base, how to understand the search results displayed, and showcases what the webpage of a single study entry in the knowledge base looks like.

Using the search bar

The search bar allows the user to search a single word or phrase, or search using multiple terms. For example:

- University and Refugee not France
- +University +Refugee -France'

When each individual term is entered, the search filters will update, causing a little delay before the user can enter the next term. Users can also click and select from the various search filters below the search bar.

Understanding the search results

Once the desired combination of search terms and search filter selections has been made, the user can click either the SEARCH or FILTER buttons to reveal a list of search results. Figure 1 illustrates the search results after using the HERE knowledge base's search functions. The search results include a title, a preview of the abstract (if available), and the curated filter keywords assigned to each study using the data extraction codebook.

Figure 1. Search results

The screenshot displays the HERE search interface. On the left, there is a search bar and a list of filters including Theme, Year of publication, Method, Education type, Education level, Document type, Country, and Language. Below these filters are checkboxes for 'Open access only' and 'Yes', and a 'FILTER' button. On the right, the search results are displayed, each with a title, a brief abstract, and a list of filter keywords. The results include:

- The dynamics of recent refugees' language acquisition: how do their pathways compare to those of other new immigrants?** (Keywords: English, Routledge, Language education, Non-formal education, Germany, Acculturation, Longitudinal study)
- Understanding Participation Experiences in Sport Programs for the Acculturation of Refugee Youth: A Comparative Study of Two Different Programs in the US and Sweden** (Keywords: Integration & assimilation, English, Access & participation, Mental health & psychosocial well-being, Routledge, Sweden, Acculturation, Sports & physical education)
- What works to facilitate displaced and refugee-background students' access and participation in European higher education: results from a multilingual systematic review** (Keywords: Socio-economic status, Integration & assimilation, Inclusion, English, Access & participation, Routledge, Tertiary education, Language education, Review)
- Experiences of forced migration: learning for educators and learners: a report** (Keywords: Pedagogy, Taylor and Francis Ltd, Teachers & educational staff, United Kingdom, Interview, Integration & assimilation, English, Access & participation, Mental health & psychosocial well-being, Tertiary education)
- Voices heard. Autobiographical accounts of language learning after forced migration** (Keywords: Teachers & educational staff, English, Routledge, Language education, Germany, Sports & physical education)
- Opening up the University: Teaching and Learning with Refugees**

Anatomy of a single search result

Clicking on a search result of interest takes the user to the webpage of that particular study. Figure 2 illustrates a sample webpage of a particular search result. Each search result webpage includes a title, an abstract (if available), the curated filter keywords assigned to each study using the data extraction codebook, the author-assigned keywords (if available), and the publication source (DOI, ISBN, ISSN, and/or URL). Each search result webpage also previews two related studies that might relate to the search result.

Figure 2. Sample webpage of a search result

The screenshot shows a webpage layout for a research article. At the top left is the logo for 'HERE HUB FOR EUROPEAN REFUGEE EDUCATION'. The main title is 'The dynamics of recent refugees' language acquisition: how do their pathways compare to those of other new immigrants?'. To the right of the title is a red arrow pointing left labeled 'Title'. Below the title is the abstract text, with a red arrow pointing left labeled 'Abstract'. To the left of the abstract is a 'Filter keywords' section with a red arrow pointing right, listing categories like AUTHOR, THEME, YEAR OF PUBLICATION, METHOD, EDUCATION TYPE, DOCUMENT TYPE, PUBLISHER, COUNTRY, LANGUAGE, and OPEN ACCESS. Below the abstract is the 'Publication Source' section with a red arrow pointing left, showing the source as 'Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies' and providing DOI and ISSN numbers. Below that is the 'Author Keywords' section with a red arrow pointing left, listing 'Destination-language proficiency', 'Germany', 'Language acquisition', 'New immigrants', and 'Refugees'. At the bottom are 'RELATED POSTS' with two preview cards: 'German Language Acquisition of Refugee Children—The Role of Preschools and Language Instruction' and 'Language education for forced migrants: Governance and approach'. A red arrow labeled 'Related Studies' points to the right from the bottom right of the page.

CONCLUSION AND FUTURE DIRECTIONS

The HERE knowledge base is an ongoing and systematic data searching and curational effort for the sharing and mobilisation of knowledge of the education *about* and *for* refugees and forced migrants who arrived in Europe. Another aim of the HERE knowledge base is to develop evidence syntheses that enable the mobilisation of

knowledge about refugees' and forced migrants' educational trajectories towards ensuring their right to an inclusive and equitable quality education in Europe (UNGA, 1951, 1967; UNESCO, 1960). Such evidence synthesis exercises will be made available and open access through the HERE website (<https://hubhere.org/>) as well as through other academic and non-academic channels.

Synthesis of results

Data from the HERE knowledge base is intended to be further analysed to identify patterns related to education *about* and *for* refugees in Europe using a variety of evidence synthesis approaches that include, but are not limited to, systematic reviews, scoping reviews, rapid reviews, meta-analyses, meta-syntheses, and umbrella reviews (Aromataris and Munn, 2020; Page et al., 2021a; Page et al., 2021b). These results will be reported and disseminated regularly on the HERE website as well as through peer-reviewed publications and conference presentations.

Technical report registration and future amendments

This technical report is deposited on the Nottingham Research Data Management Repository (<https://rdmc.nottingham.ac.uk/>). Any amendments made to the technical report will be reported on the Nottingham Research Data Management Repository as an amendment, along with the reason for the amendment. The latest version of the technical report will also be hosted on the HERE website (<https://hubhere.org/>).

Availability of data

The data that support this technical report have been made openly available on the HERE website (<https://hubhere.org/>).

Acknowledgements

The authors would like to acknowledge the HERE Steering Committee members for their time and willingness to contribute their intellectual expertise and advice with us in developing the work of HERE.

Funding

The authors would like to acknowledge the Open Society Foundations for funding the work of HERE.

Conflicts of interest

The authors declare that they have no conflicts of interest.

REFERENCES

- Aleghfeli, Y. K., & Hunt, L. (2022). Education of unaccompanied refugee minors in high-income countries: Risk and resilience factors. *Educational Research Review*, 100433. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.edurev.2022.100433>
- Aromataris, E., & Munn, Z. (2020). *JBI Manual for Evidence Synthesis*. Joanna Briggs Institute. <https://doi.org/10.46658/jbimes-20-01>
- European Union. (2023). *EuroVoc Concept Scheme: 7206 Europe*. Publications Office of the Publications Office of the EU. <https://op.europa.eu/s/yHUS>
- McIntyre, J., & Abrams, F. (2020). *Refugee Education: Theorising Practice in Schools* (1st ed.). Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780429263811>
- Miles, M. B., & Huberman, A. M. (1994). *Qualitative data analysis: An expanded sourcebook* (2nd ed.). Sage Publications, Inc.
- Page, M. J., McKenzie, J. E., Bossuyt, P. M., Boutron, I., Hoffmann, T. C., Mulrow, C. D., ... & Moher, D. (2021a). The PRISMA 2020 statement: an updated guideline for reporting systematic reviews. *bmj*, 372, n71. <https://doi.org/10.1136/bmj.n71>
- Page, M. J., Moher, D., Bossuyt, P. M., Boutron, I., Hoffmann, T. C., Mulrow, C. D., ... & McKenzie, J. E. (2021b). PRISMA 2020 explanation and elaboration: updated guidance and exemplars for reporting systematic reviews. *bmj*, 372, n160. <https://doi.org/10.1136/bmj.n160>
- United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees. (2022). *UNHCR Mid-Year Trends 2022*. <https://www.unhcr.org/uk/statistics/unhcrstats/635a578f4/mid-year-trends-2022.html>

United Nations General Assembly. (1951). Convention Relating to the Status of Refugees. *United Nations, Treaty Series*, 189, 137.

<https://www.refworld.org/docid/3be01b964.html>

United Nations General Assembly. (1967). Protocol Relating to the Status of Refugees. *United Nations, Treaty Series*, 606, 267.

<https://www.refworld.org/docid/3ae6b3ae4.html>

United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation. (1960). *Convention Against Discrimination in Education*. <https://www.refworld.org/docid/3ae6b3880.html>